

Scrutineers report

Julien Goodwin, January 15, 2025

[Compliance with the Constitution](#)

[Scrutiny of Election](#)

[Results analysis for contested roles](#)

[Vice President](#)

[Ordinary Council Member](#)

[Results of election](#)

[Additional scrutiny](#)

Dear Council,

As Returning Officer for the 2025 Council Election I am taking on a duty to ensure that;

- The Election has been run in line with the Linux Australia Constitution, with an estimated 71 members voting¹, above the quorum of 5.
- That the results of the Election have been scrutinised, and appropriate checks made to satisfy a reasonable person that the integrity of the Election has been upheld
- And to report my findings, adverse or otherwise, to Council, who are responsible to act on those findings

This email serves as a record of the actions taken to ensure the above, and serves as a formal process for Returning Officers to follow in years to come.

In summary my findings are that:

- The election has been run in line with the Linux Australia Inc., [Constitution as per the Linux Australia website](#)
- The results of the Election have been scrutinised, and I am satisfied that the integrity of the Election has been upheld
- The recommendation from previous years that the CiviCRM election module eliminate candidates who are elected to lower-ranked positions if they are already elected to a higher ranked position is still required.
- The recommendation from 2023 to scrub vote data from past (before 2022) elections is still required.

Detailed notes follow. These notes include PII references that will need to be redacted if this report is presented to members.

¹ Due to intentional vote data anonymization this number is not guaranteed accurate.

Julien Goodwin

January 15th 2024

Compliance with the Constitution

S(15) of the Constitution stipulates the following requirements, which I have validated:

- Nominations of candidates and their consent to be nominated is handled via the CiviCRM election module; no manual check done
- The number of nominations exceeds the number of positions, and a ballot is being held, via the CiviCRM election module
- The ballot cannot be conducted more than 60 days before an AGM; the AGM is 20 January 2025, the ballot occurred after nominations closed on 7 January 2025. This is in line with the Constitution.
- A person nominated to Council must be a current member of Linux Australia, Inc. This is enforced by the CiviCRM election module; no manual check done

I am satisfied that the Constitution has been complied with.

Scrutiny of Election

The SQL used to scrutinise is shown in this report, both as a record of validity, and also if needed for future elections.

The election_id for this election in the civicrm_election table is 13.

```
MariaDB [lacivicrm]> SELECT id,name FROM civicrm_election ORDER BY voting_end_date
DESC LIMIT 4;
+-----+-----+
| id | name |
+-----+-----+
| 13 | Linux Australia Council Election 2025 |
| 12 | Linux Australia Council Election 2024 |
| 11 | Linux Australia Council Election 2023 |
| 10 | Linux Australia Council Election 2022 |
+-----+-----+
> SET @election_id = 13;
```

From this we determine the positions in the election. There are 5 positions.

```
> SELECT id,name,quantity,sortorder FROM `civicrm_election_position`
WHERE election_id = @election_id;
```

id	name	quantity	sortorder
48	President	1	1
49	Vice-President	1	2
50	Secretary	1	3
51	Treasurer	1	4
52	OCM	3	5

We can see the ids of the positions.

From this we determine the nominations for the positions.

```
> SELECT id,is_eligible_candidate,has_accepted_nomination,has_rejected_nomination,election_position_id,member_nominee FROM
`civicrm_election_nomination` WHERE election_position_id IN (SELECT id FROM `civicrm_election_position` WHERE election_id =
@election_id);
```

id	is_eligible_candidate	has_accepted_nomination	has_rejected_nomination	election_position_id	member_nominee
119	1	1	0	48	13525
120	1	1	0	49	10422
125	0	0	0	49	14762
128	1	1	0	49	15581
122	1	1	0	50	10357
127	1	1	0	50	15821
118	1	1	0	51	10414
117	0	0	0	52	14762
121	1	1	0	52	10422
123	1	1	0	52	15634
124	1	1	0	52	15641
126	1	1	0	52	15821
129	1	1	0	52	10567
130	1	1	0	52	11661

```
# The non-eligible candidates specifically:
> SELECT id,is_eligible_candidate,has_accepted_nomination,has_rejected_nomination,election_position_id,member_nominee FROM
`civicrm_election_nomination` WHERE election_position_id IN (SELECT id FROM `civicrm_election_position` WHERE election_id =
@election_id) AND (is_eligible_candidate = 0 OR has_accepted_nomination = 0 OR has_rejected_nomination = 1);
```

Two nominated candidates were not ultimately eligible for the election:

- #125 (Member#14762 Lilac Kapul for VP)
 - Was only self-nominated, with no second
- #117 (Member#14762 Lilac Kapul for OCM)
 - Was only self-nominated, with no second

This was verified by querying the actual nominations table.

```
> select id,member_nominator,election_nomination_id from
civicrm_election_nomination_seconder WHERE election_nomination_id IN
(117,125);
```

id	member_nominator	election_nomination_id
254	14762	117
269	14762	125

From this we determine the number of votes, and their rank for each nomination.

Reviewing the list of positions and nominations show only three contested roles, Vice President & Secretary (in both cases one chosen from two candidates) and OCM (three chosen from six candidates, however see below).

```
> SELECT election_position_id, COUNT(*) AS candidates,
civicrm_election_position.name
  -> FROM civicrm_election_nomination
  -> LEFT JOIN civicrm_election_position ON
civicrm_election_nomination.election_position_id =
civicrm_election_position.id
  -> WHERE has_accepted_nomination=1 AND election_position_id IN
(SELECT id FROM civicrm_election_position WHERE election_id =
@election_id) GROUP BY election_position_id;
```

election_position_id	candidates	name
48	1	President
49	2	Vice-President
50	2	Secretary
51	1	Treasurer
52	6	OCM

Results analysis for contested roles

Details for only the contested roles (Vice President, Secretary, OCM) follow.

Vice President

```
> select count(id) AS votes,rank,election_nomination_id from
civicrm_election_vote WHERE election_nomination_id IN (SELECT id FROM
civicrm_election_nomination WHERE has_accepted_nomination=1 AND
election_position_id=49) GROUP BY rank,election_nomination_id ORDER
BY rank ASC,votes DESC;
```

votes	rank	election_nomination_id
57	1	128
9	1	120
50	2	120
9	2	128

Candidate #128 (Jennifer Cox) was elected.

Secretary

```
> SELECT COUNT(id) AS votes,rank,election_nomination_id from
civicrm_election_vote WHERE election_nomination_id IN (SELECT id FROM
civicrm_election_nomination WHERE has_accepted_nomination=1 AND
election_position_id=50) GROUP BY rank,election_nomination_id ORDER
BY rank ASC,votes DESC;
```

votes	rank	election_nomination_id
53	1	122
13	1	127
50	2	127
13	2	122

Candidate #122 (Neill Cox) was elected.

Ordinary Council Member

Unlike in many previous years no candidates had to be eliminated due to being elected to a higher office, so the results as presented on the website will be correct.

```
> SELECT COUNT(id) AS votes,rank,election_nomination_id from
civicrm_election_vote WHERE election_nomination_id IN (SELECT id FROM
civicrm_election_nomination WHERE has_accepted_nomination=1 AND
election_position_id=52 AND election_nomination_id NOT IN (99999))
GROUP BY rank,election_nomination_id ORDER BY rank ASC,votes DESC;
```

votes	rank	election_nomination_id
30	1	123
9	1	121
8	1	129
8	1	124
5	1	126
5	1	130
25	2	123
14	2	124
9	2	121
8	2	129
7	2	126
1	2	130
18	3	124
15	3	121
15	3	129
7	3	126
6	3	130

3	3	123
14	4	129
13	4	124
12	4	130
10	4	121
10	4	126
5	4	123
22	5	130
15	5	126
10	5	121
9	5	129
7	5	124
1	5	123
20	6	126
18	6	130
11	6	121
10	6	129
4	6	124
1	6	123

Two candidates received sufficient first votes to be elected, they are #123 (Elena Williams) and #121 (Jonathan Woithe).

Then two candidates both received 8 first votes to be elected, but on second preferences candidate #124 (Lilly Hoi Sze Ho) beat candidate #129 (Andrew Pam) and is elected.

Using an approval style count, eliminating the candidate with the lowest number of votes and redistributing their votes based on the supplied preferences, then repeating until only three candidates remain may have changed the result, and it is possible, however due to intentional limitations clearing vote data post-elections, not possible to prove that in this case Andrew Pam may have been elected instead of Lilly Hoi Sze Ho.

Results of election

- President - Joel Addison (uncontested)
- Vice President - Jennifer Cox
- Secretary - Neill Cox
- Treasurer - Russell Stuart (uncontested)
- Ordinary Council Members
 - Elena Williams
 - Jonathan Woithe
 - Lilly Hoi Sze Ho

Additional scrutiny

The following checks were also done.

The civicrm_election_vote table timestamps were checked for any irregular patterns none were found.

Note: The records of which member voted for which candidates have been correctly scrubbed for this election, however, as noted in the 2023 report they are oddly inconsistent for prior elections, and this has not been corrected.

```
> SELECT * FROM civicrm_election_vote WHERE election_nomination_id IN  
(SELECT id FROM civicrm_election_nomination WHERE  
election_position_id IN (SELECT id FROM `civicrm_election_position`  
WHERE election_id = @election_id)) ORDER BY id ASC;
```

<elided>

Estimate of unique voters:

```
> SELECT COUNT(DISTINCT created_at) FROM civicrm_election_vote WHERE  
election_nomination_id IN (SELECT id FROM civicrm_election_nomination  
WHERE election_position_id IN (SELECT id FROM  
`civicrm_election_position` WHERE election_id = @election_id)) ORDER  
BY id ASC;
```

```
+-----+  
| COUNT(DISTINCT created_at) |  
+-----+  
|                               71 |  
+-----+
```

The civicrm_election_nomination table timestamps were checked for any irregular patterns; none were found.

```
> SELECT * FROM civicrm_election_nomination WHERE  
election_position_id IN (SELECT id FROM `civicrm_election_position`  
WHERE election_id = @election_id) ORDER BY id ASC;
```

<elided>

END REPORT